

# Comparing the Child-Rearing Goals of Women in Taiwan and in its Marriage-based Immigrants' Countries of Origin

**Shou-Lu Lee**

Tzu Chi University, Taiwan  
leeshoulu@mail.tcu.edu.tw

**Abstract:** This study compares the child-rearing goals of women in Taiwan and in Taiwanese immigrant women's countries of origin. The logit regression results clearly show distinct cultural variations in child-rearing goals in different countries, even when differences in socio-economic status are considered. Despite their complex historical links, Chinese women do not appear to be more similar to Taiwanese women than are Indonesian, or Vietnamese women in terms of child-rearing goals. These findings have implications for the socio-economic policies of the Taiwanese government and effective communication and instruction in schools. In addition, the findings also have implications for Asian countries affected by marriage immigration and emigration.

**Keywords:** Child-rearing goals, Migrants, World values survey, China, Indonesia, Thailand, Taiwan, Vietnam

If you are a parent, what traits do you want your children to have: independence, obedience, or unselfishness? Parental views regarding child-rearing have received extensive research attention because of their importance in understanding parenting behaviors (Tulviste, Mizera, De Geer, & Tryggvason, 2007). Parenting behaviors in turn have been shown by numerous studies to have a strong influence on children's outcomes, including academic achievement, the development of social and moral values, lifelong development and adaptation, and emotional

development and mental health.<sup>1</sup> Therefore, parental child-rearing goals affect the direction of a nation's socio-economic development because children are the future leaders of a nation (Bélanger, 2010; Ko & Chang, 2007; Tulviste et al., 2007).

Because of these important implications, cultural variations in parental child-rearing goals have received significant attention in the literature (Tulviste & Ahtonen, 2007). Thus, the purpose of this study is to compare the child-rearing goals of women in Taiwan and in

Taiwanese marriage-based immigrants' countries of origin. Knowledge of cultural variations in child-rearing goals is particularly important for certain Asian countries where international marriages have become common, such as Japan, Singapore, South Korea, and Taiwan (Bélanger, 2010; Jones, 2012). Specifically, in Taiwan, the number of new marriage-based immigrants from January 1987 to April 2014 reached more than 490,574 (Department of Household Registration, 2014).

China accounts for 67.62% of Taiwanese marriage-based immigrants, and 28.17% are from Southeast Asia. Moreover, the vast majority of immigrants are women (Department of Household Registration, 2014). Female marriage immigrants from China and Southeast Asia have injected new life into Taiwanese society by decelerating the decline of the birth rate. Meanwhile, the parenting practices of migrant parents in Taiwan have also become an issue deserving of attention.

As demonstrated in the studies of Chiu (1987), Lin and Fu (1990), Kelley and Tseng (1992), Li (2001), Liu (2007), and McCabe et al. (2013), the child-rearing attitudes of migrants are strongly affected by the traditional cultural values and practices in their home countries. Therefore, knowledge of cultural variations in the child-rearing goals of women in Taiwan and the countries represented by marriage-based immigrants is desirable. This knowledge could provide insight into Taiwan's future socio-economic development and help Taiwan become a truly multicultural society. Moreover, knowledge of Taiwan's child-rearing practices would be beneficial for women preparing to immigrate to Taiwan. However, to date, there is a dearth of literature exploring this issue. Given the number of Chinese immigrants, it is particularly striking that no study has compared Taiwanese child-rearing goals to Chinese child-rearing goals. Moreover, existing studies comparing child-rearing goals fail to consider

multiple interwoven factors that could lead to biased conclusions (Gujarati & Porter, 2010). The existing literature does not provide an adequate examination of the similarities and differences between the child-rearing goals of women who are marriage migrants and Taiwanese women. Therefore, further studies on this topic are clearly needed.

The contributions of the current study are as follows: First, this study provides new empirical evidence of cultural variations in child-rearing goals across Asian nations. Much cross-cultural research has been devoted to comparing societies in Africa, Latin America, the Pacific, and Asia. Some recent studies have compared Western cultures to one another. However, there is little cross-cultural research comparing Asian cultures with one another. Second, this study covers more countries represented by Taiwan's major marriage-based immigrants—China, Vietnam, Indonesia, and Thailand—which complements the lack of research comparing Taiwanese culture and the culture of immigrants' countries of origin.

Third, this study utilizes a more advanced statistical method than that used in the existing literature. Specifically, multivariate logit regressions with heteroskedasticity-consistent standard errors were employed to analyze the determinants of child-rearing goals. Although several studies, such as those of Cashmore and Goodnow (1986) and Tulviste et al. (2007), have also employed multivariate analysis techniques (e.g., analysis of variance and analysis of covariance), these studies fail to consider possible heteroskedasticity in the variance. Adopting heteroskedasticity-consistent standard errors, the current study offers more reliable statistical inferences and thus provides more meaningful comparisons.

The remainder of this study is organized as follows: Section 2 reviews the literature; Section 3 describes the data source and the empirical methodology; and Section 4 reports and discusses the empirical results, and the final section

provides conclusions and suggestions.

## LITERATURE REVIEW

To date, many studies have been conducted to explore cultural variations in child-rearing goals. Most of these studies have focused on comparing goals across individualistic and collectivistic cultures (Tulviste et al., 2007). Generally, Western cultures promote individualist values, while non-Western cultures are more oriented toward collectivistic values (De Vos, 1985; Ho, 1986; Hsu, 1985; Kağıtçıbaşı, 1996; Markus & Kitayama, 1991; Miller, 1988; Triandis, McCusker, & Hui, 1990; Triandis, 1995; Yang, 1986). To explore these variations, such studies have compared parental child-rearing goals between Western nations and non-Western nations.

Consistent with the results of the studies mentioned above, parents from Western nations were found to be more likely to encourage the development of more autonomous personalities, whereas parents from non-Western nations were shown to be more likely to encourage their children to develop collective values, such as group harmony and belongingness (Ekstrand & Ekstrand, 1987; Friedlmeier, Busch, & Trommsdorff, 2003; Harkness & Super, 1995; Harwood, Handwerker, Schoelmerich, & Leyendecker, 2001; Harwood, Miller, & Irizarry, 1995; Jose, Huntsinger, Huntsinger, & Liaw, 2000; Tulviste et al., 2007; Williams & Ispa, 1999). However, several comparative studies have shown that the dichotomy between individualism and collectivism may be overly simplistic and thus may not adequately explain cultural variations in parental child-rearing goals.

Parents have been found to differ significantly in their child-rearing goals, even among Western nations with individualistic cultures. Comparing the parenting goals in 16 nations, Baer, Curtis, Grabb, and Johnston (1996) found that American

parents valued independence, hard work, and leadership more than parents from Australia, Belgium, Canada, France, Japan, Iceland, Italy, the Netherlands, Norway, Spain, and West Germany. In their recent comparative study, Tulviste and Ahtonen (2007) revealed that valuing intelligence and politeness is restricted to the Estonian culture, whereas valuing hedonism is exclusive to the Finnish culture. Comparing mothers in Estonia, Finland, and Sweden, Tulviste et al. (2007) found that Estonian mothers emphasize traditional child-rearing goals (e.g., conformity, obedience, and hard work) more than Finnish mothers do, whereas Swedish mothers do not emphasize such traditional goals at all.

However, parents from predominantly individualistic cultures have also been found to hold certain values that are typical of a collectivistic orientation and vice versa (Baer et al., 1996; Leyendecker, Lamb, Harwood, & Schölmerich, 2002; Tudge, Hogan, Snezhkova, Kulakova, & Etz, 2000; Wang & Phinney, 1998). Moreover, Lin and Fu (1990) reported that Taiwanese parents living in Taiwan or the U.S. emphasized independence and achievement more than Caucasian American parents did. Furthermore, Wang and Tamis-Lemonda (2003) found that U.S. mothers value connectedness more than Taiwanese mothers do.

In addition to culture, many researchers have emphasized the importance of the socio-economic status of families in shaping parental child-rearing goals. In fact, some cultural differences in child-rearing goals may disappear when differences in socio-economic status are considered (Cashmore & Goodnow, 1986). However, differences related to socio-economic status are not found for all types of parental goals (Tulviste & Mizera, 2010). Moreover, studies show that multiple indicators of socio-economic status should be used rather than a composite measure (Cashmore & Goodnow, 1986; Otto, 1975).

According to Kohn (1969) and his followers, parents tend to value traits that they have found to be important to achieve success in their own endeavors (Tulviste et al., 2007). Therefore, variations in child-rearing goals may be associated with socio-economic status indicators such as occupation, income, education, and subjective social class (Kohn, 1969). Generally, middle-class parents tend to emphasize self-direction, whereas working-class parents are more likely to emphasize the importance of conformity (Cashmore & Goodnow, 1986; Chiu, 1991; Hwang, 1997; Ma & Smith, 1990; Tudge et al., 1999; Tulviste & Ahtonen, 2007).

Occupation has been found to be associated with certain parenting goals in the studies of Kohn (1969), Chiu (1991) and Menaghan and Parcel (1991), and family income was found to be associated with parenting goals in the works of Cashmore and Goodnow (1986) and Yang (2009). Education was found to be the most important socio-economic status variable in accounting for differences in parental child-rearing goals in many nations, according to the review of Hoff-Ginsberg and Tardif (1995). Similar results were found in Taiwanese studies, including those of Hwang (1997) and Ma and Smith (1993). Nevertheless, Tulviste and Mizera (2010) reported that educational differences affected the value placed on conformity only in the child-rearing goals of Estonian mothers. Moreover, Tulviste and Ahtonen (2007) found no significant effect of education on the parenting goals of Estonian and Finnish mothers. To the best of our knowledge, Kohn (1969) is the only study showing an influence of subjective social class on parenting goals.

The above studies compared the child-rearing goals of societies in Africa, Latin America, the Pacific, and Asia, and some studies have compared Western cultures to one another. Nevertheless, there is little cross-cultural research comparing various Asian cultures with one another. Ko and Chang (2007) may be the only

published study that compares cultural variations in the child-rearing goals of women in Taiwan and two major marriage-based immigrants' countries of origin. The authors concluded that there are no distinct differences in child-rearing goals among the three nations without formal statistical inference.

Although enlightening, the study of Ko and Chang (2007) did not address the influences of socio-economic differences; thus, their findings are not likely to accurately reflect the cultural variations in child-rearing goals among the nations studied. Moreover, Ko and Chang (2007) did not include China, the country of origin with the largest immigrant population in Taiwan. In fact, approximately two-thirds of Taiwan's female immigrants are from China (Department of Household Registration, 2014). This study addresses these research gaps by comparing the child-rearing goals of women in Taiwan and four countries of origin represented by the largest populations of marriage-based immigrants (China, Vietnam, Indonesia, and Thailand), and socio-economic indicators are included in these comparisons.

## METHODS

This study uses data from the fifth wave of the World Values Survey. Using a common questionnaire, the World Values Survey provides nationally representative data from participating nations and thus allows for meaningful cross-cultural comparison. The surveys for Indonesia, Vietnam, and Taiwan were conducted in 2006, and those for China and Thailand were conducted in 2007.<sup>2</sup> I analyzed 2,859 questionnaires that contained all of the information pertinent to this study. This number included 544, 666, 655, 317, and 677 women in Taiwan, China, Vietnam, Indonesia, and Thailand, respectively.

The survey contained a list of 10 child-rearing goals: (1) independence, (2) hard work, (3) a feeling of responsibility, (4) imagination, (5)

tolerance and respect for other people, (6) thrift, saving money and things, (7) determination and perseverance, (8) religious faith, (9) unselfishness, and (10) obedience. Each of these goals was selected as either important or not important by the participants. Because the choices were dichotomous, this study used logit models to empirically analyze the responses (Gujarati & Porter, 2009; Hill, Griffiths, & Lim, 2012).

Specifically, the empirical logit regression for each child-rearing goal is specified below<sup>3</sup>:

$$\ln\left(\frac{p_i}{1-p_i}\right) = \beta_0 + \sum_{k=1}^m \beta_k X_{ik} + \mu_i$$

where  $p_i$  is the probability that the modeled goal is chosen as being important by sample  $i$ ,  $X_{ik}$  is the  $k^{\text{th}}$  explanatory variable, and  $\mu_i$  is the error term. The errors are independent but have distinct variances.

To examine the cultural variations in the importance of these 10 child-rearing goals, the explanatory variables included four national dummies with Taiwan as the base category for China, Vietnam, Indonesia, and Thailand.<sup>4</sup> To account for the influence of occupation, this study also included four occupational variables in the survey measuring working environment and occupational conditions: (1) cognitivity, (2) creativity, (3) autonomy, and (4) supervision (Chiu, 1991; Hwang, 1997; Kohn, 1969; Ma & Smith, 1990; Ma & Smith, 1993; Wei & Yang, 2010; Yang, 2009).

The first three occupational variables were rated on a 10-point Likert-type scale. The ratings for the cognitivity variable ranged from 1 = *primarily manual tasks* to 10 = *primarily cognitive tasks*. The creativity variable was rated from 1 = *primarily routine tasks* to 10 = *primarily creative tasks*. Similarly, the autonomy variable indicated the degree of independence

from 1 = *no independence at all* to 10 = *complete independence*. The supervision variable was a dummy variable representing the supervision of other people at work.

The explanatory variables also contained two educational dummy variables in which elementary school served as the reference category. The high school variable was coded as 1 if a respondent had obtained a high school diploma. Likewise, the college variable was coded as 1 if a respondent had obtained at least a college degree. The subjective social class variables consisted of three dummy variables, with the subjective lower class as the reference category. The middle-upper class variable was coded as 1 if a respondent considered herself middle-upper class or above. The middle-lower class dummy was coded as 1 if a respondent considered herself to be middle-lower class. The working class dummy was defined similarly.

The family income variable included in this study was assessed using a 10-point scale. The values of this variable ranged from 1 to 10, representing the lowest to highest income groups. In addition to the above variables that have been explored in existing child-rearing goal studies, the current study also included age, a dummy variable of being a parent, and the number of children raised by each respondent. The age variable was included because people in different stages of life may have different child-rearing values (Kuan & Wang, 2005). The dummy variable representing being a parent and the number of children raised were included to assess the possible influence of child-rearing experience (Wei & Yang, 2010).

## RESULTS

The empirical results of the logit regression are presented in Tables 1 through 10. The tables address child-rearing goals in the same order as previously mentioned.

Table 1 presents the results for independence as the child-rearing goal. With respect to the national dummies, China, Vietnam, and Thailand had statistically significant and negative coefficients at the 1% level. Moreover, these coefficient estimates indicated that, all other things being equal, the Chinese, Vietnamese, and Thai women were 1.658, 3.247, and 5.747 times less likely, respectively, than Taiwanese women to choose independence as an important child-rearing goal. By contrast, the Indonesia dummy variable had an insignificant coefficient. This coefficient indicated no significant difference between Indonesian and Taiwanese women in

terms of choosing independence as an important child-rearing goal. Thus, Indonesian women were the most similar to Taiwanese women, and Thai women were the least similar in terms of choosing independence as an important child-rearing goal.

Occupation was the only significant socio-economic variable associated with emphasizing independence; women who supervised other people at work were more likely to value this trait. This result is consistent with the proposition that parents tend to value traits that they view as important to achieving success in their own endeavors (Kohn, 1969).

**Table 1**

*Logit Regression for Independence as a Child-Rearing Goal*

Variable	Coefficient	p-value	Odds ratio	VIF
Constant	0.962***	0.000	2.616	
China	-0.507***	0.001	0.603	2.084
Indonesia	-0.118	0.538	0.889	1.657
Vietnam	-1.178***	0.000	0.308	2.471
Thailand	-1.752***	0.000	0.174	2.200
Cognitivity	0.010	0.608	1.010	1.810
Creativity	0.017	0.375	1.017	1.477
Autonomy	-0.009	0.591	0.991	1.127
Supervision	0.374***	0.001	1.454	1.401
High school	0.169	0.093	1.185	1.520
College	0.142	0.387	1.153	1.877
Middle-upper class	0.045	0.831	1.046	3.595
Middle-lower class	0.006	0.973	1.006	4.213
Working class	-0.064	0.712	0.938	4.363
Family income	0.039	0.134	1.040	1.479
Age	0.002	0.530	1.002	1.941
Being a parent	0.084	0.539	1.087	1.805
Number of children	-0.034	0.350	0.966	2.334
Chi-square statistics	269.822***	0.000		
Prediction accuracy	65.300%			

Notes:

1. The reported chi-square statistics test the null hypothesis that all coefficients of the explanatory variables are zero.
2. The reported p-values are based on heteroskedasticity-consistent standard errors.
3. VIF stands for variance inflation factor. Values of VIF that exceed 10 indicate collinearity.
4. \*\* Significant at the 5% level. \*\*\* Significant at the 1% level.

Table 2 presents the results for hard work as a child-rearing goal. Again, the China, Vietnam, and Thailand dummies had statistically significant coefficients at the 1% level, whereas the Indonesia dummy did not. Moreover, the China, Vietnam dummies had a positive coefficient, and the Thailand dummy had a negative coefficient. These coefficients indicated that, all other things being equal, women in China and Vietnam were 3.917 and 6.065 times more likely and women in Thailand were 5.05 times less likely than women in Taiwan to choose hard work as an important child-rearing goal. Indonesians were similar to Taiwanese in valuing this child-rearing goal. The

greatest difference in the child-rearing goal of hard work was found between Vietnamese and Taiwanese women.

Education and age were found to be important to the differences observed in the emphasis on hard work. Specifically, the college variable had a significant and negative coefficient, which indicates that female college graduates were less likely to choose hard work as an important child-rearing goal than those with an elementary school education. The age variable had a significant and positive coefficient indicating that older women were more likely than younger women to value hard work.

**Table 2**

*Logit Regression for Hard Work as a Child-Rearing Goal*

Variable	Coefficient	p-value	Odds ratio	VIF
Constant	-0.226	0.466	0.797	
China	1.365***	0.000	3.917	2.084
Indonesia	0.195	0.226	1.215	1.657
Vietnam	1.802***	0.000	6.065	2.471
Thailand	-1.621***	0.000	0.198	2.200
Cognitivity	-0.036	0.085	0.965	1.810
Creativity	-0.039	0.054	0.961	1.477
Autonomy	0.010	0.588	1.010	1.127
Supervision	0.103	0.373	1.108	1.401
High school	0.095	0.415	1.099	1.520
College	-0.326**	0.047	0.722	1.877
Middle-upper class	-0.260	0.288	0.771	3.595
Middle-lower class	-0.279	0.189	0.756	4.213
Working class	-0.017	0.937	0.983	4.363
Family income	0.059	0.051	1.061	1.479
Age	0.021***	0.000	1.021	1.941
Being a parent	-0.246	0.104	0.782	1.805
Number of children	-0.022	0.622	0.978	2.334
Chi-square statistics	930.223***	0.000		
Prediction accuracy	98.000%			

Notes:

1. The reported chi-square statistics test the null hypothesis that all coefficients of the explanatory variables are zero.
2. The reported p-values are based on heteroskedasticity-consistent standard errors.
3. VIF represents the variance inflation factor. Values of VIF that exceed 10 indicate collinearity.
4. \*\* Significant at the 5% level. \*\*\* Significant at the 1% level.

Table 3 presents the results for the feeling of responsibility as a child-rearing goal. The national dummies all had statistically significant and negative coefficients. These coefficients indicated that, all other factors being equal, women in China, Indonesia, Vietnam, and Thailand were 6.494, 1.931, 4.255, and 9.174 times less likely, respectively, than Taiwanese women to choose the feeling of responsibility as an important child-rearing goal. In terms of emphasizing a feeling of responsibility when rearing their children, the similarity between Indonesian and Taiwanese women was the

strongest, whereas the similarity between the Thai and Taiwanese women was the weakest.

This table also shows that subjective social class was an important variable in accounting for the differences observed in emphasizing the feeling of responsibility. Specifically, both the middle-lower class and working class dummies had significant and positive coefficients. These coefficients indicated that women in the middle-lower class and the working class were more likely than women in the lower class to perceive a feeling of responsibility as an important child-rearing goal.

**Table 3**

*Logit Regression for a Feeling of Responsibility as a Child-Rearing Goal*

Variable	Coefficient	p-value	Odds ratio	VIF
Constant	1.969***	0.000	7.165	
China	-1.871***	0.000	0.154	2.084
Indonesia	-0.657***	0.009	0.518	1.657
Vietnam	-1.449***	0.000	0.235	2.471
Thailand	-2.213***	0.000	0.109	2.200
Cognitivity	0.004	0.845	1.004	1.810
Creativity	-0.021	0.320	0.980	1.477
Autonomy	0.013	0.468	1.013	1.127
Supervision	0.172	0.150	1.188	1.401
High school	0.159	0.151	1.173	1.520
College	0.288	0.122	1.334	1.877
Middle-upper class	0.350	0.110	1.419	3.595
Middle-lower class	0.613***	0.001	1.845	4.213
Working class	0.449**	0.011	1.567	4.363
Family income	-0.053	0.060	0.948	1.479
Age	0.005	0.270	1.005	1.941
Being a parent	0.115	0.432	1.122	1.805
Number of children	-0.030	0.454	0.970	2.334
Chi-square statistics	271.445***	0.000		
Prediction accuracy	74.300%			

Notes:

1. The reported chi-square statistics test the null hypothesis that all coefficients of the explanatory variables are zero.
2. The reported p-values are based on heteroskedasticity-consistent standard errors.
3. VIF represents the variance inflation factor. Values of VIF that exceed 10 indicate collinearity.
4. \*\* Significant at the 5% level. \*\*\* Significant at the 1% level.

The regression results for imagination as a child-rearing goal are presented in Table 4. Among the national dummies, only the dummies for China and Thailand were statistically significant. The positive coefficients indicated that Chinese and Thai women were more likely to value imagination. The odd ratios revealed that Chinese and Thai women were 1.859 and 2.226 times more likely to emphasize imagination than Taiwanese women. In this regard, the views of Indonesian and Vietnamese were similar to those of Taiwanese women, whereas the views of Thai women were the least similar to those of Taiwanese women.

The occupational creativity variable had a positive and significant coefficient. This coefficient revealed that women who perform primarily creative tasks were more likely to select imagination as an important child-rearing goal. The coefficient of the college dummy was also significant and positive; which revealed that more imagination was emphasized by college graduates than by women with only an elementary school education. The age variable had a significant and negative coefficient. This result suggested that older women value imagination less than younger women in child rearing.

**Table 4**

*Logit Regression for Imagination as a Child-Rearing Goal*

Variable	Coefficient	p-value	Odds ratio	VIF
Constant	-2.021***	0.000	0.133	
China	0.620***	0.000	1.859	2.084
Indonesia	0.134	0.503	1.143	1.657
Vietnam	-0.173	0.353	0.841	2.471
Thailand	0.800***	0.000	2.226	2.200
Cognitivity	0.013	0.541	1.013	1.810
Creativity	0.043**	0.032	1.044	1.477
Autonomy	0.027	0.165	1.028	1.127
Supervision	0.114	0.335	1.120	1.401
High school	0.168	0.171	1.183	1.520
College	0.730***	0.000	2.075	1.877
Middle-upper class	0.218	0.408	1.244	3.595
Middle-lower class	0.450	0.051	1.568	4.213
Working class	0.454**	0.043	1.575	4.363
Family income	-0.009	0.763	0.991	1.479
Age	-0.012***	0.010	0.988	1.941
Being a parent	-0.033	0.834	0.968	1.805
Number of children	-0.051	0.307	0.950	2.334
Chi-square statistics	152.093***	0.000		
Prediction accuracy	79.200%			

Notes:

1. The reported chi-square statistics test the null hypothesis that all coefficients of the explanatory variables are zero.
2. The reported p-values are based on heteroskedasticity-consistent standard errors.
3. VIF stands represents the variance inflation factor. Values of VIF that exceed 10 indicate collinearity.
4. \*\* Significant at the 5% level. \*\*\* Significant at the 1% level.

The regression results for tolerance and respect for other people as the child-rearing goal are presented in Table 5. The national dummies all had statistically significant coefficients. These coefficients were negative and indicated that, all other things being equal, women in Taiwan valued tolerance and respect for other people more than women in the major marriage-based immigrants' countries of origin. In particular, Chinese, Indonesians, Vietnamese, and Thai women were 1.992, 1.996, 2.985, and 2.809 times less likely, respectively, than Taiwanese women to choose tolerance and respect for other people as an important child-rearing goal. Chinese women were the most similar and Vietnamese were least similar to Taiwanese women in their

opinions regarding the importance of this child-rearing goal.

Both the cognitivity and creativity variables had significant coefficients. The positive coefficient of the former variable indicates that women who perform more cognitive tasks at work more strongly value tolerance and respect for other people. The negative coefficient of the latter variable reveals that women performing primarily creative tasks at work place less emphasis on tolerance and respect for other people.

The coefficients of the middle-upper class and middle-lower class dummies were positive and significant at the 5% and 1% levels, respectively. The coefficients revealed that women from the

**Table 5**

***Logit Regression for Tolerance and Respect for Other People***

<b>Variable</b>	<b>Coefficient</b>	<b>p-value</b>	<b>Odds ratio</b>	<b>VIF</b>
Constant	1.079***	0.000	2.942	
China	-0.690***	0.000	0.502	2.084
Indonesia	-0.691***	0.000	0.501	1.657
Vietnam	-1.092***	0.000	0.335	2.471
Thailand	-1.032***	0.000	0.356	2.200
Cognitivity	0.081***	0.000	1.084	1.810
Creativity	-0.057***	0.002	0.945	1.477
Autonomy	0.027	0.098	1.027	1.127
Supervision	0.039	0.712	1.040	1.401
High school	0.155	0.119	1.168	1.520
College	0.276	0.084	1.317	1.877
Middle-upper class	0.471**	0.022	1.601	3.595
Middle-lower class	0.456***	0.007	1.578	4.213
Working class	0.269	0.105	1.309	4.363
Family income	-0.046	0.062	0.955	1.479
Age	-0.008**	0.028	0.992	1.941
Being a parent	-0.134	0.312	0.874	1.805
Number of children	0.099***	0.007	1.104	2.334
Chi-square statistics	173.970***	0.000		
Prediction accuracy	64.700%			

Notes:

1. The reported chi-square statistics test the null hypothesis that all coefficients of the explanatory variables are zero.
2. The reported p-values are based on heteroskedasticity-consistent standard errors.
3. VIF represents the variance inflation factor. Values of VIF that exceed 10 indicate collinearity.
4. \*\* Significant at the 5% level. \*\*\* Significant at the 1% level.

middle-upper and middle-lower classes attach more importance to tolerance and respect for other people than women from the lower class do. The significant and negative coefficient of the age variable implies that older women emphasize tolerance and respect for other people less than younger women do. Furthermore, the dummy for being a parent had a positive and significant coefficient. This result implies that child-rearing experience increases the likelihood of valuing tolerance and respect for other people as a child-rearing goal.

Table 6 provides the regression results for thrift, saving money and things as the child-rearing goal. The coefficients of national dummies were all negative and statistically significant. These

coefficients indicated that women in Taiwan valued thrift, saving money and things more than women in the major marriage-based immigrants' countries of origin. Specifically, Chinese, Indonesian, Vietnamese, and Thai women were 1.608, 2.309, 1.560, and 1.792 times less likely, respectively, than Taiwanese women to choose thrift, saving money and things as an important child-rearing goal. Therefore, with regard to this goal, Chinese and Indonesian marriage-based immigrants were the least similar to Taiwanese women, and Vietnamese women were the most similar to Taiwanese women.

Both the cognitivism and autonomy variables in the occupational category had significant and negative coefficients. This result suggests

**Table 6**

*Logit Regression for Thrift, Saving Money and Things*

Variable	Coefficient	p-value	Odds ratio	VIF
Constant	1.474***	0.000	4.365	
China	-0.474***	0.001	0.622	2.084
Indonesia	-0.837***	0.000	0.433	1.657
Vietnam	-0.444***	0.003	0.641	2.471
Thailand	-0.584***	0.000	0.558	2.200
Cognitivism	-0.059***	0.001	0.943	1.810
Creativity	0.000	0.988	1.000	1.477
Autonomy	-0.031**	0.045	0.969	1.127
Supervision	-0.042	0.681	0.959	1.401
High school	-0.095	0.340	0.910	1.520
College	-0.537***	0.000	0.585	1.877
Middle-upper class	0.103	0.609	1.108	3.595
Middle-lower class	0.091	0.594	1.095	4.213
Working class	0.155	0.364	1.168	4.363
Family income	-0.024	0.333	0.976	1.479
Age	0.000	0.968	1.000	1.941
Being a parent	-0.159	0.228	0.853	1.805
Number of children	0.104***	0.008	1.110	2.334
Chi-square statistics	123.210***	0.000		
Prediction accuracy	64.500%			

Notes:

1. The reported chi-square statistics test the null hypothesis that all coefficients of the explanatory variables are zero.
2. The reported p-values are based on heteroskedasticity-consistent standard errors.
3. VIF represents the variance inflation factor. Values of VIF that exceed 10 indicate collinearity.
4. \*\* Significant at the 5% level. \*\*\* Significant at the 1% level.

that women who perform more cognitive tasks or operate more independently at work value thrift, saving money and things less than their counterparts do. The significant and negative coefficient of the college dummy revealed that college graduates placed less emphasis on this trait. The significant and positive coefficient of the dummy of being a parent suggests that women with children tend to care more about thrift, saving money and things than those without children.

Table 7 provides the regression results with determination and perseverance as the child-rearing goal. With respect to the national dummies, the coefficients of Vietnam and

Thailand dummies were significant at the 1% level, and those of the China and Indonesia dummies were significant at the 5% level. With the exclusion of China, all other national dummies had positive coefficients. These coefficients revealed that Indonesian, Vietnamese, and Thai women valued determination and perseverance more than Taiwanese women did. However, Chinese women emphasized this trait less than Taiwanese women did. Specifically, Indonesian, Vietnamese, and Thai women were 1.471, 3.149, and 1.832 times more likely, respectively, than Taiwanese women to emphasize determination and perseverance, whereas Chinese women are 1.364 times less likely to do so. These results

**Table 7**

*Logit Regression for Determination and Perseverance*

Variable	Coefficient	p-value	Odd ratio	VIF
Constant	-0.844***	0.001	0.430	
China	-0.310**	0.024	0.733	2.084
Indonesia	0.386**	0.014	1.471	1.657
Vietnam	1.147***	0.000	3.149	2.471
Thailand	0.606***	0.000	1.832	2.200
Cognitivity	0.012	0.532	1.012	1.810
Creativity	0.038**	0.031	1.039	1.477
Autonomy	0.011	0.473	1.011	1.127
Supervision	0.007	0.942	1.007	1.401
High school	0.218**	0.027	1.244	1.520
College	-0.064	0.673	0.938	1.877
Middle-upper class	0.002	0.991	1.002	3.595
Middle-lower class	0.009	0.960	1.009	4.213
Working class	-0.064	0.708	0.938	4.363
Family income	-0.008	0.729	0.992	1.479
Age	-0.001	0.771	0.999	1.941
Being a parent	-0.094	0.475	0.911	1.805
Number of children	-0.014	0.710	0.986	2.334
Chi-square statistics	212.899***	0.000		
Prediction accuracy	62.200%			

Notes:

1. The reported chi-square statistics test the null hypothesis that all coefficients of the explanatory variables are zero.
2. The reported p-values are based on heteroskedasticity-consistent standard errors.
3. VIF represents the variance inflation factor. Values of VIF that exceed 10 indicate collinearity.
4. \*\* Significant at the 5% level. \*\*\* Significant at the 1% level.

reveal that Chinese women were the most similar and Vietnamese women were the least similar to Taiwanese women in terms of valuing this child-rearing goal.

Regarding the occupational variables, creativity had a significant and positive coefficient. This coefficient shows that women who perform primarily creative tasks at work valued this trait more than those performing primarily routine tasks. The high school dummy also had a significant and positive coefficient, which implies that women with high school diplomas valued determination and perseverance more than those who had only an elementary school education.

Table 8 shows the regression results for religious faith as a child-rearing goal. China, Indonesia, and Thailand dummies all had statistically significant coefficients. The China dummy was negative, whereas the Indonesian and Thai dummies were positive. These coefficients indicate that Chinese women are 6.494 times less likely and Indonesian and Thai women are 98.612 and 4.487 times more likely than Taiwanese women to perceive religious faith as an important trait for their children. The Vietnam dummy's insignificant coefficient indicated that there was no significant difference in the value of this trait by Vietnamese and Taiwanese women. Therefore, in emphasizing religious faith as a

**Table 8**

*Logit Regression for Religious Faith*

Variable	Coefficient	p-value	Odd ratio	VIF
Constant	-1.595***	0.000	0.203	
China	-1.871***	0.000	0.154	2.084
Indonesia	4.591***	0.000	98.612	1.657
Vietnam	-0.133	0.593	0.875	2.471
Thailand	1.501***	0.000	4.487	2.200
Cognitivity	-0.004	0.899	0.996	1.810
Creativity	-0.102***	0.001	0.903	1.477
Autonomy	0.007	0.773	1.007	1.127
Supervision	0.172	0.231	1.188	1.401
High school	0.072	0.663	1.075	1.520
College	0.581***	0.009	1.788	1.877
Middle-upper class	0.510	0.134	1.666	3.595
Middle-lower class	0.382	0.204	1.465	4.213
Working class	-0.146	0.627	0.864	4.363
Family income	-0.104***	0.004	0.901	1.479
Age	-0.011	0.078	0.989	1.941
Being a parent	0.016	0.934	1.017	1.805
Number of children	0.125**	0.024	1.133	2.334
Chi-square statistics	1237.520***	0.000		
Prediction accuracy	88.100%			

Notes:

1. The reported chi-square statistics test the null hypothesis that all coefficients of the explanatory variables are zero.
2. The reported p-values are based on heteroskedasticity-consistent standard errors.
3. VIF represents the variance inflation factor. Values of VIF that exceed 10 indicate collinearity.
4. \*\* Significant at the 5% level. \*\*\* Significant at the 1% level.

parenting goal, Vietnamese women were the most similar to Taiwanese women, and Indonesian women were most different from Taiwanese.

With respect to occupational variables, creativity had a significant and negative coefficient. The coefficient revealed that women who perform primarily creative tasks were less likely to select religious faith as an important child-rearing goal. Regarding education, the coefficient of the college dummy was significant and positive and revealed that more emphasis was placed on this trait by college graduates than by women with only an elementary school education. The significant and positive coefficient of the dummy for being a parent suggested that

women with children care more about this trait than women without children. In contrast, family income had a significant and negative coefficient. This result indicated that high-income families emphasize religious faith as an important child-rearing goal less than low-income families do.

Table 9 presents the results for unselfishness as a child-rearing goal. Except for the Vietnam dummy, all national dummies had insignificant coefficients. These coefficients showed that Chinese, Indonesian, and Thai women were not significantly different from Taiwanese women in terms of valuing this trait. By contrast, the positive coefficient of the Vietnam dummy was statistically significant at the 5% level.

**Table 9**

*Logit Regression for Unselfishness*

Variable	Coefficient	p-value	Odd ratio	VIF
Constant	-0.333	0.210	0.717	
China	0.124	0.365	1.132	2.084
Indonesia	0.135	0.408	1.144	1.657
Vietnam	0.331**	0.026	1.392	2.471
Thailand	0.181	0.198	1.198	2.200
Cognitivity	-0.009	0.634	0.991	1.810
Creativity	-0.009	0.629	0.991	1.477
Autonomy	-0.008	0.621	0.992	1.127
Supervision	-0.059	0.579	0.943	1.401
High school	-0.040	0.689	0.961	1.520
College	0.318**	0.032	1.375	1.877
Middle-upper class	-0.185	0.361	0.831	3.595
Middle-lower class	0.116	0.497	1.123	4.213
Working class	-0.147	0.378	0.863	4.363
Family income	-0.009	0.726	0.991	1.479
Age	-0.004	0.306	0.996	1.941
Being a parent	-0.078	0.548	0.925	1.805
Number of children	-0.035	0.372	0.966	2.334
Chi-square statistics	32.055**	0.015		
Prediction accuracy	66.000%			

Notes:

1. The reported chi-square statistics test the null hypothesis that all coefficients of the explanatory variables are zero
2. The reported p-values are based on heteroskedasticity-consistent standard errors.
3. VIF represents the variance inflation factor. Values of VIF that exceed 10 indicate collinearity.
4. \*\* Significant at the 5% level. \*\*\* Significant at the 1% level.

Specifically, Vietnamese women were 1.392 times more likely than Taiwanese women to consider unselfishness to be an important child-rearing goal. Therefore, regarding the emphasis on unselfishness, the Vietnamese were different from the Taiwanese, whereas the opinions of Chinese, Indonesian, and Thai women were similar to those of the Taiwanese women.

The college dummy also had a significant coefficient for this trait. The coefficient was significant and positive, indicating that female college graduates placed more weight on unselfishness than women with only an elementary school education.

Table 10 presents the results for obedience as a child-rearing goal. The Indonesia, Vietnam, and Thailand dummies had statistically significant coefficients revealing that women in these three nations valued obedience more than Taiwanese women did. Specifically, Indonesian, Vietnamese, and Thai women were 7.774, 1.605, and 6.581 times more likely, respectively, than Taiwanese women to consider this trait to be an important child-rearing goal. In contrast, the insignificant coefficient of the China dummy indicated that Chinese and Taiwanese women were not significantly different in valuing obedience.

**Table 10**

*Logit Regression for Obedience*

Variable	Coefficient	p-value	Odd ratio	VIF
Constant	-1.726***	0.000	0.178	
China	0.044	0.800	1.045	2.084
Indonesia	2.051***	0.000	7.774	1.657
Vietnam	0.473***	0.006	1.605	2.471
Thailand	1.884***	0.000	6.581	2.200
Cognitivity	-0.074***	0.000	0.929	1.810
Creativity	0.034	0.101	1.035	1.477
Autonomy	-0.006	0.744	0.994	1.127
Supervision	-0.158	0.163	0.854	1.401
High school	-0.018	0.870	0.983	1.520
College	-0.226	0.174	0.798	1.877
Middle-upper class	-0.591**	0.011	0.554	3.595
Middle-lower class	-0.291	0.137	0.748	4.213
Working class	-0.020	0.915	0.980	4.363
Family income	0.079***	0.005	1.082	1.479
Age	0.002	0.581	1.002	1.941
Being a parent	0.095	0.507	1.100	1.805
Number of children	-0.009	0.813	0.991	2.334
Chi-square statistics	432.934***	0.000		
Prediction accuracy	72.100%			

Notes:

1. The reported chi-square statistics test the null hypothesis that all coefficients of the explanatory variables are zero.
2. The reported p-values are based on heteroskedasticity-consistent standard errors.
3. VIF represents the variance inflation factor. Values of VIF that exceed 10 indicate collinearity.
4. \*\* Significant at the 5% level. \*\*\* Significant at the 1% level.

Regarding the occupational variables, cognitivism had a significant and negative coefficient. This coefficient indicates that women who perform more cognitive tasks at work valued obedience less than those largely performing manual tasks. Social class also accounted for differences in the emphasis on this trait. The result for women from the middle-upper class had a significant and negative coefficient, indicating that women in this class were less likely to choose obedience as an important child-rearing goal than those in the lower class. By contrast, family income had a significant and positive coefficient; thus, high-income families valued obedience more than low-income families did.

In summary, the results clearly showed that socio-economic status variables shape child-rearing goals. The emphasis of all goals was affected by one or more of the components of socio-economic status. Occupation influenced the selection of independence; imagination; tolerance and respect for other people; thrift, saving money and things; determination and perseverance; and religious faith. Education affected the selection of hard work; imagination; thrift, saving money and things; determination and perseverance, religious faith, and unselfishness. Subjective social class influenced the choices of a feeling of responsibility, imagination, tolerance and respect for other people, and obedience. Age influenced the choice of hard work, imagination, and tolerance and respect for other people. Family income affected the preference of religious faith and obedience. The number of children affected the preference of imagination, tolerance and respect for other people, thrift, saving money and things, and religious faith. These results confirm the wisdom of Otto (1975), who called for the use of multiple indicators of socio-economic status in research. These results are also consistent with the finding of Tulviste and Mizera (2010) that differences related to socio-economic status do not manifest in all types of parenting goals.

More importantly, the results showed distinctive cultural variations in the 10 child-rearing goals between Taiwanese women and women from the four major marriage-based immigrants' countries of origin, even when differences in socio-economic status were controlled. However, the emphasis placed on certain goals did not differ between the countries of origin and Taiwan. This pattern is consistent with the finding of Cashmore and Goodnow (1986) that certain cultural differences in child-rearing goals disappear when differences in socio-economic status are controlled.

Among the 10 child-rearing goals, Chinese women differed from Taiwanese women on eight of these goals. Chinese women valued the following six traits less than Taiwanese women did: (1) independence; (2) a feeling of responsibility; (3) tolerance and respect for other people; (4) thrift, saving money and things; (5) determination and perseverance; and (6) religious faith. By contrast, Chinese women valued hard work and imagination more than Taiwanese women did. Chinese and Taiwanese women were similar in terms of valuing unselfishness and obedience.

Compared with Chinese women, Indonesians were more similar to Taiwanese women in the value placed on child-rearing goals. Indonesian and Taiwanese women were similar in valuing independence, hard work, imagination, and unselfishness. However, Indonesians placed less emphasis on the feeling of responsibility; tolerance and respect for other people; and thrift, saving money and things. By contrast, Indonesian women tended to value determination, perseverance, and religious faith more than Taiwanese women did.

Compared with Taiwanese women, Vietnamese women placed more emphasis on hard work, determination and perseverance, unselfishness, and obedience in their children. However, Vietnamese women placed less emphasis on independence; a feeling of

responsibility; tolerance and respect for other people; and thrift, saving money and things. Vietnamese women were similar to Taiwanese women in their evaluation of the importance of imagination and religious faith in their goals for their children.

The expectations of Thai and Taiwanese women for their children were similar only for the goal of unselfishness. Compared with Taiwanese women, Thai women selected imagination, determination and perseverance, religious faith, and obedience in their children as more important than Taiwanese women did. However, Thai women placed less value on independence; hard work; a feeling of responsibility; tolerance and respect for other people; and thrift, saving money and things.

## CONCLUSIONS

This study differed from previous studies by comparing 10 child-rearing goals of women in Asian countries: Taiwan, China, Indonesia, Vietnam, and Thailand. The empirical results clearly revealed distinct cultural variations in the child-rearing goals of women in countries dominated by collectivistic cultures, even when differences in socio-economic status were considered. Specifically, women in Indonesia, Vietnam, and Thailand differed from Taiwanese women in six, eight, and nine child-rearing goals, respectively. More importantly, contrary to general expectations and despite complex historical links, women in China (the country of origin of the vast majority of marriage-based immigrants) did not appear to be more similar to Taiwanese women than marriage-based immigrants from other Asian countries were. Compared with Taiwanese women, Chinese women placed different levels of emphasis on eight of the 10 parenting goals, similar to Vietnamese women, whereas fewer differences were found in the responses of Indonesian women.

The results of this research have many implications. First, marriage-based immigrants are likely to have significant economic and societal consequences for Taiwan through the outcomes of their children. When planning socio-economic policies, the Taiwanese government should consider these multicultural influences. Second, information regarding the expectations and goals for children in the countries studied may be helpful to school-teachers in Taiwan. Understanding these goals, expectations, and desired traits may help teachers to understand their students' personalities and to develop more effective communications with their students' parents. Third, the governments of the migrants' home countries should educate potential migrants about cultural differences, as this knowledge would be valuable for migrants preparing for their lives in Taiwan. Finally, as in Taiwan, countries in Asia that are experiencing an increase in marriage-based immigrants should consider economic and societal influences from cross-border immigrants that may arise despite their common Asian heritage. However, further studies should be conducted to confirm these results and conclusions.

## ENDNOTES

<sup>1</sup>This list is based on the findings of many studies: Berg-Nielsen & Holen (2003); Chambers, Power, Loucks, & Swanson (2000); Chang (2009); Chien (1978); Desforges and Abouchaar (2003); Fish, Amerikaner, & Lucas (2007); Hirsijärvi and Perälä-Littunen (2001); Hoff-Ginsberg and Tardif (1995); Holden (1995); Hsieh (2007); Kordi & Baharudin (2010); Lin, Lee, & Wu (2006); Martin and Waite (1994); Robertson and Simons (1989); Sheeber, Hops, & Dvais (2001); Shu, Lo, & Lung (1999); Su (1976).

<sup>2</sup>The fifth wave of the World Values Survey provides the most recent available data on child-rearing goals for the five nations. As parenting values and beliefs are stable and slow to change over time (Keller et al., 2004), the timing of the surveys does not reduce the significance of the current study.

<sup>3</sup>Child-rearing goals are important but difficult to study empirically. One approach involves listening to how people respond to survey questions. Admittedly, the responses are subjective measures and may be subject to skepticism. However, because of the lack of availability of objective measures, this approach is widely adopted in previous studies. Following these studies, the current study examines responses from the World Value Survey. Fortunately, Oswald and Wu (2010) have provided evidence that subjective data contain genuine information about what is intended to be measured. However, future studies may still benefit from conducting analyses with objective measures of child-rearing goals.

<sup>4</sup>The selection of the base category does not affect research conclusions (Gujarati & Porter, 2009; Lee & Wang, 2010). The dummy variable approach can only show the cultural variations but cannot tell why these countries value these goals. The reasons that explain why the countries value these goals are beyond the scope of the current study and are left for future research.

## ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The author would like to thank two anonymous reviewers for their helpful and insightful comments. The grant support for this study from Taiwan's Ministry of Science and Technology (NSC 102-2410-H-320 -005) is also gratefully acknowledged.

## REFERENCES

- Baer, D., Curtis, J., Grabb, E., & Johnston, W. (1996). What values do people prefer in children? A comparative analysis of survey evidence from fifteen countries. In C. Seligman, J. M. Olson, & M. P. Zanna (Eds.), *The psychology of value: The Ontario symposium* (Vol. 8, pp. 299–328). Mahwah, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum.
- Bélanger, D. (2010). Marriages with foreign women in East Asia: Bride trafficking or voluntary migration? *Population and Societies*, (469), 1-4.
- Berg-Nielsen, T. S., & Holen, A. (2003). From clinical towards research interview: Parenting problems with troubled adolescents. *Scandinavian Journal of Psychology*, 44(4), 319-329.
- Cashmore, J. A., & Goodnow, J. J. (1986). Influences on Australian parents' values: Ethnicity versus socioeconomic status. *Journal of Cross-Cultural Psychology*, 17(4), 441-454.
- Chambers, J. A., Power, K. G., Loucks, N., & Swanson, V. (2000). Psychometric properties of the parental bonding instrument and its association with psychological distress in a group of incarcerated young offenders in Scotland. *Social Psychiatry and Psychiatric Epidemiology*, 35(7), 318-325.
- Chang, K.-P. (2009). A study on parental rearing attitude, family mental environment, and teenager's Internet addiction. *Journal of Family Education and Counseling*, 6, 93-117.
- Chien, M.-F. (1978). Impact of parental attitudes on adjustment of elementary school children. *Bulletin of Educational Psychology*, 11, 63-85.
- Chiu, H.-Y. (1991). *The new theory of social psychology*. Taipei: Strong Current.
- Chiu, L.-H. (1987). Child-rearing attitudes of Chinese, Chinese-American, and Anglo-American mothers. *International Journal of Psychology*, 22(4), 409-419.
- De Vos, G. (1985). Dimensions of the self in Japanese culture. In A. Marsella, G. De Vos, & F. L. K. Hsu (Eds.), *Culture and self: Asian and Western perspectives* (pp. 141-182). London: Tavistock.
- Department of Household Registration. (2014). Recent demographic data for each month. Retrieved from [http://www.ris.gov.tw/zh\\_TW/346](http://www.ris.gov.tw/zh_TW/346)
- Desforges, C., & Abouchaar, A. (2003). *The impact of parental involvement, parental support and family education on pupil achievements and adjustment: A literature review* (Research Report No. 433). Retrieved from U.K., Department for Education website: <http://www.education.gov.uk/publications/standard/publicationDetail/Page1/RR433#downloadableparts>
- Ekstrand, G., & Ekstrand, L. H. (1987). Children's perception of norms and sanctions in two cultures. In C. Kagitcibasi (Ed.), *Growth and progress in cross-cultural psychology* (pp. 171–180). Berwyn, PA: Swets North America.
- Fish, M., Amerikaner, M. J., & Lucas, C. J. (2007). Parenting preschoolers in rural Appalachia: Measuring attitudes and behaviors and their relations to child development. *Parenting: Science & Practice*, 7(3), 205-233.

- Friedlmeier, W., Busch, H., & Trommsdorff, G. (2003). *Characteristics of an ideal child*. Paper presented at the XIth European Conference on Developmental Psychology, Milan, Italy.
- Gujarati, D. N., & Porter, D. C. (2009). *Basic econometrics* (4th ed.). New York: McGraw-Hill.
- Gujarati, D. N., & Porter, D. C. (2010). *Essentials of econometrics* (4th ed.). New York: McGraw-Hill.
- Harkness, S., & Super, C. M. (1995). Culture and parenting. In M. H. Bornstein (Ed.), *Handbook of parenting* (Vol. 2, pp. 253-280). Hillsdale, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum.
- Harwood, R. L., Handwerker, W. P., Schoelmerich, A., & Leyendecker, B. (2001). Ethnic category labels, parental beliefs, and the contextualized individual: An exploration of the individualism-sociocentrism debate. *Parenting: Science and Practice, 1*(3), 217-236.
- Harwood, R. L., Miller, J. G., & Irizarry, N. L. (1995). *Culture and attachment: Perceptions of the child in context*. New York, NY: Guilford Press.
- Hill, R. C., Griffiths, W. E., & Lim, G. C. (2012). *Principles of econometrics* (4th ed.). Hoboken, NJ: Wiley.
- Hirsjärvi, S., & Perälä-Littunen, S. (2001). Parental beliefs and their role in child-rearing. *European Journal of Psychology of Education, 16*, 87-116.
- Ho, D. Y. f. (1986). Chinese patterns of socialization: A critical review. In M. H. Bond (Ed.), *The psychology of the Chinese people* (pp. 1-37). Hong Kong: Oxford University Press.
- Hoff-Ginsberg, E., & Tardif, T. (1995). Socioeconomic status and parenting. In M. H. Bornstein (Ed.), *Handbook of parenting* (2<sup>nd</sup> ed., Vol. 2, pp. 231-252). Mahwah, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum.
- Holden, G. W. (1995). Parental attitudes towards childrearing. In M. H. Bornstein (Ed.), *Handbook of parenting* (Vol. 3, pp. 359-392). Mahwah, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum.
- Hsieh, C.-L. (2007). The relations among parenting style, parents involvement, and behavioral adjustment in mixed marriage family. *Journal of Humanities and Social Sciences, 3*(2), 81-95.
- Hsu, F. L. k. (1985). The self in cross-cultural perspective. In A. Marsella, G. DeVos, & F. L. K. Hsu (Eds.), *Culture and self: Asian and Western perspectives* (pp. 24-55). London: Tavistock.
- Hwang, Y.-J. (1997). Occupation, education, the parental value and behavior model: Arguing against the fitness of Kohn's theory in Taiwan. *NTTU Educational Research Journal, 8*, 1-26.
- Jones, G. W. (2012). *International marriage in Asia: What do we know, and what do we need to know?* (Working Paper Series No. 174). Retrieved from National University of Singapore, Asia Research Institute website: [http://www.ari.nus.edu.sg/docs/wps/wps12\\_174.pdf](http://www.ari.nus.edu.sg/docs/wps/wps12_174.pdf)
- Jose, P. E., Huntsinger, C. S., Huntsinger, P. R., & Liaw, F.-R. (2000). Parental values and practices relevant to young children's social development in Taiwan and the United States. *Journal of Cross-Cultural Psychology, 31*(6), 677-702.
- Kağıtçıbaşı, Ç. (1996). *Family and human development across cultures: A view from the other side*. Mahwah, NJ: Psychology Press.
- Keller, H., Lohaus, A., Kuensemueller, P., Abels, M., Yovsi, R., Voelker, S., ...Mohite, P. (2004). The bio-culture of parenting: Evidence from five cultural communities. *Parenting: Science and Practice, 4*(1), 25-50.
- Kelley, M. L., & Tseng, H.-M. (1992). Cultural differences in child rearing: A comparison of immigrant Chinese and Caucasian American mothers. *Journal of Cross-Cultural Psychology, 23*(4), 444-455.
- Ko, C.-F., & Chang, H.-P. (2007). A comparative study of the social values of Vietnam, Indonesia, and Taiwan. *Taiwan Journal of Southeast Asian Studies, 4*(1), 91-111.
- Kohn, M. L. (1969). *Class and conformity: A study in values*. Homewood, IL: Dorsey.
- Kordi, A., & Baharudin, R. (2010). Parenting attitude and style and its effect on children's school achievements. *International Journal of Psychological Studies, 2*(2), 217-222.
- Kuan, P.-Y., & Wang, Y.-T. (2005). Quiet revolution: Taiwan social values change. In J.-H. Wang & Y.-H. Chang (Eds.), *Taiwan's vitality cohesion* (pp. 65-99). Taipei: Strong Current.
- Lee, S.-L., & Wang, T.-M. (2010). Temporal changes in Taiwanese child poverty inequality: Regression-based shapely value decomposing influence factors. *Taiwanese Social Work, 8*, 1-34.
- Leyendecker, B., Lamb, M. E., Harwood, R. L., & Schölmerich, A. (2002). Mothers' socialisation

- goals and evaluations of desirable and undesirable everyday situations in two diverse cultural groups. *International Journal of Behavioral Development*, 26(3), 248-258.
- Li, J. (2001). Expectations of Chinese immigrant parents for their children's education: The interplay of Chinese tradition and the Canadian context. *Canadian Journal of Education*, 26(4), 477-494.
- Lin, C. Y. C., & Fu, V. R. (1990). A comparison of child-rearing practices among Chinese, immigrant Chinese, and Caucasian-American parents. *Child Development*, 61(2), 429-433.
- Lin, Y.-S., Lee, J.-H., & Wu, Y.-C. (2006). Exploring the relationships among the parental bonding, family function and adolescents' depression. *Archives of Clinical Psychology*, 3(1), 35-45.
- Liu, F. (2007). *Child rearing goals and parent-child interaction in immigrant Chinese families* (Doctoral dissertation). Available from ProQuest Dissertation and theses database (UMI No. 3289281).
- Ma, L. C., & Smith, K. (1990). Social class, parental values, and child-rearing practices in Taiwan. *Sociological Spectrum*, 10(4), 577-589.
- Ma, L. C., & Smith, K. B. (1993). Education, social class, and parental values in Taiwan. *The Journal of Social Psychology*, 133(4), 579-580.
- Markus, H. R., & Kitayama, S. (1991). Culture and the self: Implications for cognition, emotion, and motivation. *Psychological Review*, 98(2), 224-253.
- Martin, G., & Waite, S. (1994). Parental bonding and vulnerability to adolescent suicide. *Acta Psychiatrica Scandinavica*, 89(4), 246-254.
- Mccabe, K. M., Shanley, J. R., Niec, L. N., Naaf, M., Yeh, M., & Lau, A. S. (2013). Cultural differences in the parenting of young children: An observational study of low-income Mexican American and European American families. *Child & Family Behavior Therapy*, 35(4), 307-326.
- Menaghan, E. G., & Parcel, T. L. (1991). Determining children's home environments: The impact of maternal characteristics and current occupational and family conditions. *Journal of Marriage and the Family*, 53(2), 417-431.
- Miller, J. G. (1988). Bridging the content-structure dichotomy: Culture and the self. In M. H. Bond (Ed.), *The cross-cultural challenge to social psychology* (pp. 266-282). Beverly Hills, CA: Sage.
- Oswald, A. J., & Wu, S. (2010). Objective confirmation of subjective measures of human well-being: Evidence from the U.S.A. *Science*, 327, 576-579.
- Otto, L. B. (1975). Class and status in family research. *Journal of Marriage and the Family*, 37, 315-332.
- Robertson, J. F., & Simons, R. L. (1989). Family factors, self-esteem, and adolescent depression. *Journal of Marriage and the Family*, 50(1), 125-138.
- Sheeber, L., Hops, H., & Davis, B. (2001). Family processes in adolescent depression. *Clinical Child and Family Psychology Review*, 4(1), 19-35.
- Shu, B.-C., Lo, W.-J., & Lung, F.-W. (1999). The reliability and validity of a Chinese version of the parental bonding instrument. *Nursing Research*, 7(5), 479-489.
- Su, C.-W. (1976). The perceived parental attitudes of high-achieving and under-achieving junior high school students. *Bulletin of Educational Psychology*, 9, 21-31.
- Triandis, H. C., Mccusker, C., & Hui, C. H. (1990). Multimethod probes of individualism and collectivism. *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology*, 59(5), 1006-1020.
- Triandis, H. C. (1995). *Individualism and collectivism*. Boulder, CO: Westview Press.
- Tudge, J., Hogan, D., Lee, S., Tammeveski, P., Meltsas, M., Kulakova, N., . . . Putnam, S. (1999). Cultural heterogeneity: Parental values and beliefs and their preschoolers' activities in the United States, South Korea, Russia, and Estonia. In A. Göncü (Ed.), *Children's engagement in the world* (pp. 62-96). Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Tudge, J. R., Hogan, D. M., Snezhkova, I. A., Kulakova, N. N., & Etz, K. E. (2000). Parents' child-rearing values and beliefs in the United States and Russia: The impact of culture and social class. *Infant and Child Development*, 9(2), 105-121.
- Tulviste, T., Mizera, L., De Geer, B., & Tryggvason, M. T. (2007). Child-rearing goals of Estonian, Finnish, and Swedish mothers. *Scandinavian Journal of Psychology*, 48(6), 487-497.

- Tulviste, T., & Ahtonen, M. (2007). Child-rearing values of Estonian and Finnish mothers and fathers. *Journal of Cross-Cultural Psychology, 38*(2), 137-155.
- Tulviste, T., & Mizera, L. (2010). Socialization values of mothers of Estonian preadolescents. *European Journal of Developmental Psychology, 7*(3), 295-308.
- Wang, C.-H. C., & Phinney, J. S. (1998). Differences in child rearing attitudes between immigrant Chinese mothers and Anglo-American mothers. *Early Development and Parenting, 7*(4), 181-189.
- Wang, S., & Tamis-LeMonda, C. S. (2003). Do child-rearing values in Taiwan and the United States reflect cultural values of collectivism and individualism? *Journal of Cross-Cultural Psychology, 34*(6), 629-642.
- Wei, M.-H., & Yang, C.-C. (2010). A study on factors influencing parents' rearing attitudes in central part of Taiwan. *Journal of Education National Changhua University of Education, 18*, 65-91.
- Williams, D., & Ispa, J. M. (1999). A comparison of the child-rearing goals of Russian and US university students. *Journal of Cross-Cultural Psychology, 30*(4), 540-546.
- Yang, H.-K. (2009). The influence of parents' socioeconomic status on parental values and behavior—A test of the Kohn's theory on parents of junior high school students in Taitung. *Journal of Taipei Municipal University of Education: Education, 40*(2), 145-180.
- Yang, K.-S. (1986). Chinese personality and its change. In M. H. Bond (Ed.), *The psychology of the Chinese people* (pp. 106-170). Hong Kong: Oxford University Press.